

Appendix 3 Full responses from Community Workshop, Kirkwall

What is your initial response and/or take-home message from the film?

- More young people/children's voices should have been included in the project – they help change their parents' minds.
- Queries around how representative the selection of interviewees is and also how robust the process is to select interviewees.
- Some people who were missing from the film include a harbour master as they are first point of contact for mariners as well as someone from the fossil fuel industry, renewables and aquaculture.
- The film was also missing representation of views on tourism, specifically cruise ships.
- There was a lot of nostalgia and perhaps less thought on the future.
- A good variety of voices, people, locations, and occupations.
- Very well done movie that identifies the issues – a good starting point for further discussion.
- It is good to see some well known faces (well-known faces) from the community to help share knowledge and information – it feels more impactful when it is coming from people that you know.
- Initial uncertainty about impact but it is a good starting point for discussion. Was it sufficiently critical? Who is intended audience? It was very attention grabbing, you wanted to watch it.
- Not enough Orcadian voices.
- It was lovely to hear from older generations – are we doing enough to record their experiences of change in the marine environment over time?
- Very good film but it did not ask the question as to whether Orkney is sustainable – a missed opportunity to spark a debate on this? For example, what would constitute a sustainable level of inshore fishing/fish farms? Not a lot of data on what is a sustainable level.
- It would have been good to have had more discussion of boom-and-bust periods in Orkneys history i.e., tangle industry.
- We have a high level of knowledge and ocean literacy within the community.
- We should see the marine environment as a living laboratory and export our knowledge. We should be communicating it more widely.
- It is activities/threats out with Orkney that are having the greatest impact.
- We need to clean up the ocean.
- On the concept of sustainability – what does it mean? Is it an outcome or a process?
- There is a real need for ferries fuelled by renewable energy.

- Sustainability is vital.
- Local communities need education on the marine environment so they can become advocates.
- We have the knowledge/experience, but it is perhaps not communicated enough.
- We must find a balance between environment and human “need”.
- The film illustrated the importance of the sea to Orkney and its inhabitants.
- The film highlighted the fragility of the marine environment and its vulnerability to overfishing and over development of established industries.
- It is important to have a joined-up approach – a strategy needs to be developed for all the key players and populace as a whole.
- What was the aim? What did the film want to achieve? Not sure that it was clear.
- One of the interviewees mentioned the difference between how things look from the outside and how things are on the ground. Did they mean that the renewable energy harnessed in Orkney goes back into the grid and we’re then paying for our energy?
- When is enough enough? Who decides? How do we reign in capitalism? We are all culpable.
- Feeling of hopelessness, grief, pessimism when thinking about what is happening to the marine environment, can we stop it?
- It’s important that information on the marine environment is recorded and archived so that it is available for future generations.
- It highlights the importance of the marine environment for jobs but also for enjoyment/mental health and wellbeing.
- We need to get back to local sustainability – eating local.
- What does the word value mean? Money? Is the sea a commodity?
- Who governs the sea? Who has ultimate responsibility?

What is your relationship with the sea? In what ways does it matter to you?

- Leisure/recreation: sailing, kayaking, walking, Shorewatch, swimming.
- Scuba diving – enjoy the beauty and serenity of the underwater world.
- Wellbeing/mental health: you leave the sea feeling better than when you arrived.
- I spend a lot of my free time walking along the coast on the cliffs and beaches. This is a part of me I need, and my love of the ocean is also an awareness that we must protect her and the life within. Peace in watching stormy seas.
- You can smell the sea everywhere around Orkney and I love it!

- I have a lot of respect for the sea, I am in awe of it, and it scares me in equal measure. The sea (and the weather) makes me feel alive.
- Cultural significance and importance of the arts.
- The majesty of a wild day at Yesnaby.
- A sense of place and perspective.
- Resource: employment (tourism requires a healthy environment - tourists rave about the scenery and tranquillity).
- My occupation has been almost 100% on the sea – oyster farming, scallop diving, tourism business showing people the wrecks of Scapa Flow, ROV work.
- Food – locally source if possible.

What do you think are the key issues facing the marine environment?

- Overfishing – destructive methods, factory fishing vessels.
- It's important to support local.
- Climate change - We feel that plastic is not the main issue, it is climate change.
- Coastal erosion due to climate change a major concern.
- Lack of sand eels for puffins and other seabirds.
- Plastics - We need to be looking upstream to tackle plastic – highlighted no plastic zones in New Zealand.
- There is a lot of fishing rope on the beaches – we should be looking at alternatives.
- Pollution – both chemical and physical.
- Pollution from land/rivers, agricultural run-off.
- Shipping industry – outdated tech, increasing amount of cruise ships.
- Lack of action - faceless governance.
- Miscommunication between local/national government.
- Dearth of data.
- Overdevelopment: There has been an incredible amount of change in Orkney over the decades with growth culture and capitalism – how do you reign it in?
- No. of rigs in Scapa Flow.

- Industrialization – unsightly offshore and onshore wind turbines spoiling the expansive views – when is it enough?
- Pollution and overdevelopment by all industries including cruise ship, fishing, and fish farming.
- Renewables need to be managed sustainably.
- More people + more demands.

What would be your priorities for management?

- Holding corporate companies accountable.
- Efficient and accessible ways to dispose of marine waste.
- Clearer channels of communication.
- Reforming infrastructure so its beneficial to all.
- Research integrated with experience to achieve optimal goal – frequent reports/recording data onboard vessels.
- We should have local communities involved.
- Management based on data with environment at the top of the agenda and early consultation with communities.
- Would like to see the development of hydrogen.
- Does the planning process actually stop people doing things?
- Tackle plastics at corporation level.
- So many organisations are trying to achieve the same thing, it can be confusing to find out who to contact.
- We need a more circular economy.
- What is the environmental impact of renewable energy structures e.g., Wind turbines, wave, and tidal machines? Particularly on the seabed.
- Could seaweed around the islands be utilised as a source of tackling carbon emissions?
- Knowledge passed on via schools.
- Surveys and EIAs should use local experts with the local knowledge as well as include folk working the sea – tap local knowledge!
- Develop hydrogen powered ferries.
- Ban plastic rope (find an alternative).
- Dredgers need more regulation.
- Over tourism needs to be considered.

- Accept anecdotal data to contribute to management.
- Environment should be the top priority.
- Early consultation/liaison with developers/industry e.g., construction, cruises etc.
- Ecosystem based approach to achieve holistic management.
- Marine subsidies.
- More protected sites and stricter protection.
- Goals should be achievable and prescriptive.
- COP15 on biodiversity – 195 countries signed an agreement that 30% of all land/water areas in an ecosystem should be protected.
- We need more data on what is happening.
- View that Orkney actually isn't as sustainable as it looks with too many rigs and fish farms – comments that no area of marine life is sustainable.
- There needs to be more respect for the sea - the sea should be seen as an ecosystem not just as a resource.

How important is it for local people to be involved in decision making? In what ways?

- People need to feel invested in their future.
- Everyone needs to be involved in the process - all voices and opinions matter.
- Don't talk at us, we don't often feel we are heard.
- We often feel the decision has already been made.
- There needs to be more accessibility and visibility - just and fair for everybody.
- Are people in Orkney consulted on the no. of cruise ships or fish farms?
- There are a lot of global issues, could there be a grass roots, local forum of Orcadians rather than trying to contact council/harbour master etc.
- Really important that planners and decision makers listen to local communities, organisations rather than just talk at them and preach about what they are going to do.
- Make sure that consultations take isles folk into account – it is too Kirkwall centric.
- Needs to be meaningful consultation and more than a tick box exercise.

- In terms of your personal voice it feels like it only goes so far e.g., if you're concerned about something from an EIA in terms of development then who do you speak to directly about your concerns? Will those concerns just be papered over by developers in terms of "mitigation" that is acceptable to the "powers that be".
- Feel that there is often a problem with getting marine issues up the chain to government.